H2020-INFRAEDI-2018-2020



Concerted action for the European HPC CoEs Project Number: 823964

D2.2 – First Report on GA meetings WP2 – The HPC CoE General Assembly



Focus CoE has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under the grant agreement N° 823964

Workpackage:	2	The HPC CoE Gene	eral Assembly
Due Date	31.5.2020 (Original), 02.12.2020 (Update)		
Author(s):	Guntram Berti		Scapos AG
Authorized by	France Boillod-Cerneux		CEA
Reviewer	Bastian Koller		USTUTT
Reviewer	Simon Wong		NUI GALWAY
Reviewer	Xavier Salazar		BSC
Final Version	30.11.2020		
Date			
Dissemination	Public		
Level			

List of abbreviations

СоЕ	Centre of Excellence
GA	General Assembly
HPC3	HPC CoE Council
HPCA	High Performance Data Analytics
EHPCSW	European HPC Summit Week
EPI	European Processor Initiative
ETP4HPC	European Technology Platform for HPC
PRACE	Partnership for Advanced Computing in
	Europe
RIAG	Research and Innovation Advisory Group
	(EuroHPC)
ToR	Terms of Reference

Executive Summary

FocusCoE is a Coordination & Support Action (CSA) established in order to help the European HPC Centres of Excellence (HPC CoEs) to fulfil their role in the European HPC ecosystem: Ensuring that extreme scale applications result in tangible benefits for addressing scientific, industrial or societal challenges. One of the core goals of FocusCoE was to "establish a CoE General Assembly (GA), which will be the focal point for collaborations among CoEs."

FocusCoE developed initial Terms of References (ToR) for the CoE General Assembly, which were accepted during the inaugural meeting of the GA at the EHPCSW in Poznan in May 2019. During the inaugural meeting, the GA changed its name into European HPC CoE Council, or HPC3 for short. HCP3 elected Edouard Audit (CEA / EoCoE) as Chair, Elisa Molinari (CNR / MaX) as Vice Chair and Erwin Laure (KTH¹ / BioExcel) as General Secretary. The day-to-day operational support for HPC3 is provided by FocusCoE Work Package 2.

The initial members are the 10 currently funded HPC CoEs and FocusCoE. Other persons or organisations can be invited to participate as guests (*observers*) in HPC3 meetings on a case-by-case basis.

Starting at the meeting in Poznan, HPC3 worked at a fast pace and met on a monthly basis, with 8 remote and 2 face-to-face meetings to date. HPC3 activities to be noted in particular are:

- HPC3 wrote a letter to the chair of the EuroHPC Research and Innovation Advisory Group (RIAG) as input to their strategic R&I planning work outlining the core views of HPC3 members with respect to HPC research from an application perspective.
- HPC3 founded a working group on business development and sustainability. Work is ongoing on a general presentation featuring key scientific goals and the core competences of the CoEs, and further input into the European HPC Research Ecosystem from the application point of view.
- A number of guests were invited for discussions during HPC3 meetings: Serge Bogaerts from PRACE, Jean-Pierre Panziera the RIAG and ETP4HPC chair, Michael Malms from ETP4HPC, and representatives from the EPI project.

This series of invitations will be continued. Newly created CoEs will be incorporated as soon as they are active, first contacts have been established.

HPC3 will build on the work achieved in its first year of operation and strives to become an established voice of the application community. FocusCoE's role (besides being a member of HPC3 itself) is to establish and support the operation of HPC3. The HPC3 activities reported on herein are performed by the HPC3 members, which are for the most part external third parties (w.r.t. the FocusCoE Grant Agreement). Thus, the responsibility for conducting those activities falls outside the remit of the FocusCoE project. This construct is defined and documented in the FocusCoE DoA.

¹ Now with MPCDF (MPG)

Table of Contents

1	Intro	duction	. 8
2	The	HPC CoE Council (HPC3)	. 8
		HPC3 Goals	
	2.2	Establishment & Structure	. 8
	2.3	HPC3 Meetings and Activities	10
	2.3	.1 Meetings by Meeting Summary	11
		Next Steps & Conclusion	
3	Refe	rences	15
4	App	endix: Letter to the Chair of the EuroHPC RIAG	16
5	Char	nges to the Terms of Reference	18

Table of Figures

Figure 1 The participants of the HPC3 meeting in Luxembourg, December 16, 201910

Table of Tables

Table 1: The 11 initial members of HPC3: 10 CoEs and FocusCoE

1 Introduction

FocusCoE is a Coordination & Support Action (CSA) established in order to help the European HPC Centres of Excellence (HPC CoEs) to fulfil their role in the European HPC research ecosystem: Ensuring that extreme scale applications result in tangible benefits for addressing scientific, industrial or societal challenges. One of the concrete goals of FocusCoE is to "establish a CoE General Assembly (GA), which will be the focal point for collaborations among CoEs." The General Assembly (which was subsequently renamed HPC CoE Council or HPC3 for short) is a body of representatives from the HPC CoEs serving to foster collaboration between the CoEs, coordinate activities and bundle the CoEs' views, leading to a strong voice of the "application pillar" of the European HPC ecosystem.

The role of FocusCoE is to establish the HPC3 (the process leading to this was covered by Task 2.1 and has been reported in D2.1 [2]) and to support its operation in Task 2.2, which is the topic of this deliverable. While the activities for HPC3 are performed primarily by HPC3 members external to the FocusCoE project (except for the contributions by FocusCoE as member and in its support role) and thus outside the scope of the FocusCoE, it is part of FocusCoE's task to report on the work, the outcomes and plans of this forum in the report at hand.

In the following, in addition to presenting the goals of the HPC CoE Council, recapitulating the steps leading to the establishment of the HPC3 and describing its organization, this deliverable also reviews what has been achieved in the first year, gives an overview of the topics and results of each meeting, and provides an outlook on future activities.

The appendix includes a letter sent by HPC3 to the chair of the EuroHPC RIAG, Jean Pierre Panziera. A further confidential annex includes the detailed minutes of the HPC3 meetings during the reporting period.

2 The HPC CoE Council (HPC3)

2.1 HPC3 Goals

The FocusCoE DoA describes the goal of HPC3 as "to act as focal point for collaborations among CoEs". It can establish working groups for topics of interest to all or several CoEs, collect consolidated input from CoEs to third parties (supported by Task 2.3, see D2.3 [3]), help to develop a common point of view on an application-oriented research agenda for European HPC and serve as a common voice for the application pillar in the HPC ecosystem, thus strengthening the role of application-oriented research.

2.2 Establishment & Structure

The establishment and operation of a General Assembly (GA) for the HPC CoEs was one of the key tasks of FocusCoE.

FocusCoE started in December 2018 and held its kick-off meeting on February 20, 2019 in Frankfurt am Main. On the following day, FocusCoE invited representatives of all active HPC CoEs for a full day workshop to discuss the interactions between them and FocusCoE, and presented a roadmap for the creation of the GA. In the following months, FocusCoE developed initial Terms of Reference (ToR) for this body and discussed these with the CoEs (by email).

During the European HPC Summit Week in Poznan (13.-17.5.2019) all CoEs agreed to this initial ToR during a preparatory meeting on 13.5.2019. On May 17, 2019, the inauguration meeting of the General Assembly took place. Some changes to the initial ToR were agreed. The meeting elected Edouard Audit (CEA / EoCoE) as Chair, Elisa Molinari (CNR / MaX) as Vice Chair, and Erwin Laure (KTH² / BioExcel) as General Secretary. Also, the name of the body was changed from "HPC CoE General Assembly" to "HPC CoE Council" or HPC3 for short. More information about the process and the initial Terms of References can be found in FocusCoE Deliverable D2.1 [2].

Full Title	Project web site
BioExcel-2 Centre of Excellence for Biomolecular Research	https://bioexcel.eu/
Centre of Excellence for Exascale in Solid Earth	https://cheese-coe.eu/
A Centre of Excellence in Computational Biomedicine	https://www.compbiomed.eu/
Energy oriented Centre of Excellence for computer applications	https://www.eocoe.eu
Excellence in Simulation of Weather and Climate in Europe, Phase 2	https://www.esiwace.eu/
An e-infrastructure for software, training and consultancy in simulation and modelling	https://www.e-cam2020.eu/
The European Centre of Excellence for Engineering Applications	https://www.excellerat.eu
HPC and Big Data Technologies for Global Challenges	https://hidalgo-project.eu/
Materials design at the Exascale	http://www.max-centre.eu/
Performance Optimisation and Productivity 2	https://pop-coe.eu/
Concerted action for the European HPC CoEs	https://www.focus-coe.eu/
	 BioExcel-2 Centre of Excellence for Biomolecular Research Centre of Excellence for Exascale in Solid Earth A Centre of Excellence in Computational Biomedicine Energy oriented Centre of Excellence for computer applications Excellence in Simulation of Weather and Climate in Europe, Phase 2 An e-infrastructure for software, training and consultancy in simulation and modelling The European Centre of Excellence for Engineering Applications HPC and Big Data Technologies for Global Challenges Materials design at the Exascale Performance Optimisation and Productivity 2 Concerted action for the

In the current Terms of Reference, only active (funded) HPC CoEs and FocusCoE are members of HPC3, i.e. have voting rights (cf. Table 1). Guests (called *observers*) can be invited for individual meetings on a case-by-case basis. Newly funded CoEs will become

² Now with MPCDF (MPG)

members of HPC3 as soon as they accept the Terms of Reference. Working groups can be established by HPC3 and may have participants also from outside the member projects.

FocusCoE provides operational support to HPC3, i.e. organising the meetings and maintaining a collaboration and communication infrastructure. In some more detail, this involves:

- Setting up meeting agendas, writing minutes and following up on action items
- Setting up and maintaining mailing lists for HPC3 member representatives, working groups and HPC3 office (the latter comprising elected Chair, Vice Chair and General Secretary as well as FocusCoE WP2 support staff), maintaining a directory of HPC3 member representatives and roles
- Setting up online meetings
- Organising physical meetings
- Setting up and maintaining a document repository for HPC3 representatives, to manage e.g. documents created by HPC3, presentations given to HPC3 by guests, material provided by CoEs
- Communicating with external parties (e.g. invited observers)

2.3 HPC3 Meetings and Activities

After the inaugural face-to-face meeting in Poznan, HPC3 started to work at a considerable pace, meeting regularly on a monthly basis by phone / web conference. At the time of writing in total 10 meeting have taken place: 8 remote meetings (typically the 2nd Wednesday of each month: June, July, September, October, November 2019, February, March, and May 2020) and two face-to-face meetings: After the inaugural event in Poznan, the second in-person assembly took place on Dec 16, 2019 in Luxembourg (Figure 1); another planned face-to-face meeting during EHPCSW in Porto in March 2020 had to be replaced by a web conference, since the EHPCSW was cancelled due to the COVID-19 pandemic.



Figure 1 The participants of the HPC3 meeting in Luxembourg, December 16, 2019

One of the first actions of HPC3 was to discuss important key points for HPC research from an application perspective and collectively prepare a letter which was sent to the chair of the EuroHPC Research and Innovation Advisory Group (RIAG), Jean-Pierre Panziera, as input to the RIAG's work on EuroHPC's Research and Innovation strategy development. The letter pointed out the following key issues:

- The need for a long term perspective for the HPC application research funding, including support for cross-application software stacks and middleware.
- The funding scheme for the large, multinational CoEs should be simple and come from a single source.
- The need and concrete contents of co-design have to be clarified and driven by domain-specific aspects.
- Sufficient support for performance porting and maintenance of legacy code is needed, which is a pillar for many scientific and industrial applications.
- The link to AI and HPDA needs to be strengthened.

The full letter is appended to this deliverable.

HPC3 invited a number of guests to its meetings.

- In September 2019, Serge Bogaerts from PRACE attended the HPC3 meeting, and the interaction between PRACE and the CoEs was discussed, notably in the field of training and regarding the use of PRACE resources for purposes of code scalability development.
- Jean-Pierre Panziera (RIAG and ETP4HPC Chair) and Michael Malms (ETP4HPC) were invited for a meeting in November 2019. A detailed discussion of the points raised in the letter to RIAG mentioned above identified a considerable degree of consent on these topics. Subsequently, Michael Malms explained the ETH4HPC Strategic Research Agenda 4 (SRA4).
- In May 2020, the EPI project was presented by Romain Dolbeau, Stephane Requena and Dirk Pleiter. Discussion items included architectural paths followed by EPI and their implications on HPC application codes and options for collaborations between CoEs and EPI regarding co-design.

There was also interaction with some specific FocusCoE work packages on industrial outreach and dissemination, regarding sectorial industrial events and presentation of CoE services for academia and industry.

HPC3 has produced a general presentation, highlighting the importance of HPC to science and society and showcasing some outstanding examples of what can be achieved by Exascale computing, see [4].

2.3.1 Meetings by Meeting Summary

Inaugural meeting, 17.5.2019, Poznan

The initial Terms of Reference (ToR) were ratified unanimously. The HPC3 Officers were elected: Edouard Audit as Chair, Elisa Molinari as Vice-Chair, and Erwin Laure as General Secretary. Subsequently, a number of changes to the ToR were discussed: The maximum number of election periods of the HPC3 officers was limited to 2 periods, the naming of at

least one deputy for each member representative was strongly encouraged, and the name of the body was changed from General Assembly (GA) to HPC CoE Council (HPC3).

Open discussions revolved around the policy with respect to observers, and a clarification of the ToR regarding the establishment of working groups.

Elisa Molinari gave a report from the RIAG (Research and Innovation Advisory Group of EuroHPC). Goals and ideas for future HPC3 work were discussed, a short-term goal being to coordinate CoE input for the next RIAG SRA.

Meeting 2, 12.6.2019 (online)

During the meeting, initial positions on HPC3 input to the RIAG SRA were discussed.

Also, it was agreed that observers (guests) for a meeting should be in general be decided upon in the previous meeting and invited subsequently by the HPC3 office.

The schedule of HPC3 meetings was agreed (monthly meetings, 2nd Wednesday of each months)

Meeting 3, 10.7.2019 (online)

The letter to RIAG had been sent before the RIAG meeting on June 27, 2019. It was agreed to use the letter as the basis for a continued discussion and refinement of HPC3s positions, dubbed "position paper" in the minutes albeit no concrete publication plans were linked to that. In the sequel, this ongoing discourse in HPC3 (not explicitly mentioned below in the context of each meeting) beared fruit through facilitating for several members their activities of raising a consolidated "HPC3 point of view" related to HPC application research in various bodies, such as RIAG, INFRAG or ETH4HPC.

HPC3 discussed and decided to put together a general presentation, presenting the CoE and their goals, highlighting the scientific and technical challenges to be overcome.

Regarding updates to the ToR, it was decided to collect candidate changes and vote in updates at regular intervals (every 6 months), to avoid losing too much time with formalities.

It was decided to invite Serge Bogaerts (PRACE) for the September meeting and Jean-Pierre Panziera (RIAG) for the October meeting. Due to the holiday season, the August meeting was skipped.

Meeting 4, 4.9.2019 (online)

The main topic of the meeting was a short presentation from PRACE by S. Bogaerts and a subsequent discussion, revolving about the relationship of PRACE to HPC3 and the CoE, for instance in the area of training. PRACE and CoEs were seen as complementary: While PRACE addresses transversal topics and more generic support requests, the CoEs offer domain-specific training and application-oriented high level support.

Another topic was access to PRACE resources for application development (testing / benchmarking), as opposed to using applications to obtain scientific or technical results, which is the current focus of the PRACE policy for granting access to resources. PRACE will discuss changes to its policies in one of its next meetings.

The status and updates on the general presentation and the HPC3 positions were discussed.

Meeting 5, 9.10.2019 (online)

The discussion with RIAG had to be postponed.

Public

© Beneficiaries of the FocusCoE Project

A decision was taken to establish a working group on sustainability and business development. R. Apostolov (BioExcel) volunteered to chair this WG.

Progress on presentation and positions was discussed.

Guy Lonsdale gave a report on the "European HPC training stakeholder workshop" in Brussels, 8.10.

The next face-to-face meeting was (tentatively) scheduled prior to the cluster review in Luxembourg.

Meeting 6, 15.11. 2019 (online)

A discussion took place with J-P Panziera (RIAG) on the issues and positions raised in the HPC3 letter from June 2019. M Malms (ETP4HPC) presented key points of their latest Strategic Research Agenda (SRA 4).

J-F Lavignon (FocusCoE WP3 – industrial outreach) presented the sectorial events approach selected by the WP.

A draft presentation is now available; the next steps are to collect feedback on the draft.

Nominations for the WG on business development are reported to be lagging and the process needs to speed up.

A coordinated response to EOSC requests to CoEs regarding input for their portal was offered through FocusCoE Task 2.3.

Meeting 7, 16.12. 2019 (Luxembourg)

The WG on business development is now almost complete with nominees from all CoEs. R. Apostolov outlined his plans for the WG, highlighting the need for exchange, and the goal to work on a position paper discussing different options in the EU but also the international context.

G. Lonsdale presented the recently started FocusCoE task and initial ideas for a sustained maintenance of HPC3 after the end of the FocusCoE project.

The positions of the CoE with respect to the set of questions posed in preparation of the cluster review where exchanged and discussed. It became clear that there are different aspects to scalability and exascale performance. Not all applications have the capability to reach full exascale performance, for some, other goals and strategies are more useful, ranging from concentrating on single "fat" notes to general approaches like exposing maximum parallelism and enabling long vector operations, to make them fit for a broad range of architectures. It was felt that there is currently too little information available on the on the targeted European Architecture (e.g. EPI) to guide application development at this stage.

Also, best practices with respect to various training settings were discussed. An analysis of the trainings offered by the CoE was considered useful, FocusCoE WP4 has planned to do this type of analysis.

The current draft of the presentation was discussed, detailed comments to be directed to HPC3 office.

Some changes to the ToR were voted upon; including rules for voting quorum, handling of CoEs that are continued with a new grant but have an unfunded period ("gap"), and a simplified handling of invitations for observers, see Section 5 (Appendix).

The January meeting slot was skipped.

Meeting 8, 12.2. 2020 (online)

N. Worms (FocusCoE WP5, Dissemination) explained the ideas behind the CoE service brochure to be compiled and issued by FocusCoE. In the subsequent discussion some misrepresentations of CoEs offerings were clarified.

The WG business development will start work with a first meeting in February. A draft of the position paper has been created.

The status of the presentation was monitored to find that some updates were still missing.

Some important topics and positions regarding HPC application research were discussed during the meeting. One option discussed was to send a letter to EuroHPC explaining HPC3's positions³.

Meeting 9, 26.3. 2020 (online, as EHPCSW was cancelled)

The WG business development plans for a face-to-face workshop had to be cancelled, but an online meeting took place in March. The structure of the working paper is going to be finalised soon.

The overview presentation would benefit from further input in some cases, to highlight what could be achieved by Exascale.

Updates to the internal positions were discussed.

EPI will be invited as observer for one of the coming meetings, to discuss relationship of HW developments and applications.

Coordinators of new CoEs funded through the call last October will be contacted and invited to the next meetings.

The meeting slot on April 8 (Easter week) will be skipped unless urgent business occurs.

Meeting 10, 13.5. 2020 (online)

Dirk Pleiter and Romain Dolbeau presented an overview on EPI architecture roadmap and the role of applications in the design process. Options for (future) collaboration with CoE on codesign issues were discussed. One guideline for preparing codes to the EPI architecture that holds already now is to make applications "ARM ready" (EPI ready to give access to relevant toolchains and platforms and is interested in feedback).

Version 1 of the overview presentation is now ready.

For the June meetings, the new CoEs will be invited as observers.

2.4 Next Steps & Conclusion

One of the next steps will be incorporating of the four newly funded CoEs from the most recent call in October 2019; from June 2020, these CoEs participate in the HPC3 meetings as permanent observers and will become members once they accept the ToR. Jointly with FocusCoE work packages, HPC3 has organised an (online) CoE workshop in October 2020 in order to review and align FocusCoE plans with CoE needs, making sure added benefit is maximised, risks are properly addressed, responsibilities are clear and documented, and no important topics are overlooked. It is planned to repeat this format at regular intervals. HPC3 will continue to work on evolving and elaborating its positions and suggestions for an

³ Subsequently, this action was changed to direct communication with the EuroHPC management, following the appointment of the new Executive Director, Mr. Jensen. A meeting between the HPC Office and Mr. Jensen took place on 26.10.2020.

application-oriented research agenda and share its application-oriented point of view for HPC developments in Europe. The forum strives to become a spokesperson for the application pillar of the ecosystem and to increase its visibility inside and outside that ecosystem. Its positions have been voiced through letters and individual members and fed into relevant discussions within bodies like the EuroHPC RIAG, INFRAG or ETP4HPC, with some apparent success. Exchange with important players from the ecosystem will continue, most notably with representatives of technology-oriented R&I initiatives like EPI. HPC3 will also establish a direct link to EuroHPC beyond interaction with RIAG; a first meeting with the EuroHPC director took place on 26.10. 2020. Interactions with other players in the European HPC Ecosystem are on the agenda, e.g. the newly funded National HPC Competences Centres and the related CSA (CASTIEL). Finally, FocusCoE (supported by HPC3) will work on the establishment of a sustainable structure for HPC3, in order to ensure a persistent entity which acts as a champion for the needs of HPC applications.

3 References

[1] FocusCoE project, <u>http://www.focus-coe.eu/</u>

[2] FocusCoE Deliverable D2.1, "Report on agreed GA Procedures and Terms of Reference", Project Month 6 (May 2019)

[3] FocusCoE Deliverable D2.3, "First summary of consolidated CoE input provided to the EU HPC ecosystem", Month 18 (May 2020)

[4] HPC3 general presentation, available at <u>https://www.hpccoe.eu/index.php/hpc-coe-council/</u>

4 Appendix: Letter to the Chair of the EuroHPC RIAG



Jean-Pierre Panziera EuroHPC/RIAG Chairman

Saclay, June 25, 2019

Dear Jean-Pierre,

All the active Centres of Excellence (CoE) in high performance computing have recently decided to form the HPC CoE Council – HPC3. One of the aims of HPC3 is to promote and ensure the strong support for application development within the HPC landscape shaped by EuroHPC. Applications are essential in order to yield any science or innovation from a computer and they require important and long-term support.

Therefore, we believe that the SRA produced by the RIAG should indicate a clear path with sufficient resources for application development. More specifically, the following points seems of particular importance:

- The EuroHPC policy needs to be clearly articulated around three pillars: Infrastructure – Technology – Applications. In particular, application development is a central ingredient in order to produce science and innovation using the Exascale infrastructure. It should therefore be supported in the long term and at a proper level, as is done in other exascale projects outside Europe.
- The 50/50 funding scheme EC / Member State (MS) makes successful applications very difficult for multi-national projects like CoEs, especially if the MS funding is not gathered in a common budget. In order to continue promoting pan-European collaboration for CoEs a 100% EC funding scheme under Horizon Europe would be more appropriate
- The co-design approach is often mentioned and is an important aspect of the global HPC policy. However, the way to implement this co-design is not always clear. It should be formulated in a more specific way, driven by domain-specific aspects / computational tasks and probably be allocated to some resources in

Public

© Beneficiaries of the FocusCoE Project

relevant hardware oriented projects. Moreover, an important point should be to enable mechanisms for a strong collaboration between the applications (i.e. CoEs and other projects) and the EPI, so there will be a good set of applications available when the EPI is launched in a production system.

- Large legacy codes are key tools for many scientific and industrial communities. These codes often need to be heavily refactored for new architectures. Long term and sufficient support towards "performance portability" of these essential codes, in particular via domain specific languages or libraries, is therefore needed.
- More specific plans are needed for the sustainability of, & long-term vision for, middleware (MW) software stacks, especially for MW common to data-driven and compute-driven applications such as tensor computations and tensor decompositions. This is particularly important for multi-scale and multi-physics applications. A long-term perspective / support similar to the Community Software Initiatives or the Exascale Computing Project (e.g. xSDK project and ECP in the US) is needed. Without this long-term vision, the scientific communities will have a hard time adopting and maintaining usage of the current MW packages.
- There is a need to have a strong link with other initiative concerning AI and data analytics. Although AI is mentioned, it is not given the same importance as technologies such as HPDA. Taking into account that the (near) future HPC systems to be deployed in the main competitor countries (namely, USA, Japan, China, etc...) will be focused on AI workloads, it is important that Europe will be also ready for such challenge. Therefore, we should start talking about High Performance Artificial Intelligence and more research should be devoted to such topic.

We hope you will find these first inputs useful to feed the work of the RIAG. The HPC3 has been established only very recently and we hope to provide you with more extensive thoughts about the needs of applications in the near future. We would also of course be willing to answer specific request you might have on that matter.

Sincerely yours,

Edouard Audit, chairman, on behalf of HPC3

5 Changes to the Terms of Reference

The following changes to the Terms of Reference were decided during the Luxembourg HPC3 meeting (16.12.2019):

Discontinued CoEs membership

This topic refers to the section "Eligible members among CoEs". The term discontinued here designates CoEs which have been granted a follow-up project, but experience a gap between the end of the first funding period and the second funding periods.

Before Luxembourg meeting	Any CoE with an active grant agreement (as of May 17 th 2019) is a de-facto member of the GA. Its admission as member is realised by the CoE agreeing to the GA ToR.
	A CoE created after the date of May 17 th 2019 can be a GA member. Its admission is given when the CoE representative (and deputies) agree to the GA ToR.
	Discontinued CoEs (id est CoEs whose grant agreement will be renewed for sure and in a near future) can be GA members: A CoE member of the GA whose activities are discontinued may stay on as a GA member.
During Luxembourg meeting	Any CoE with an active grant agreement is a de-facto member of HPC3. Its admission as member is realized by the CoE agreeing to the HPC3 ToR.
6	CoEs with a "pending continuation contract" (that is, CoEs that have reached the termination date of an existing EC contract but which are waiting of the
	signature of a Grant Agreement for a follow-up or continuation) may remain an HPC3 member as long as there is no significant gap between the
	termination of the prior contract and expected commencement of the new
	contract. HPC3 will take a decision on the precise understanding of "significant gap" once informed by the CoE about the details of the pending
	continuation contract.

Here, the specific reference to the creation of HPC3 (the 17th May 2020) was deleted and replaced these 3 propositions by 2, in order to clarify the inclusion of discontinued CoEs.

Voting rules

(Refers to the section "Vote statutes")

(Refers to the section vote statutes)		
Before	Decisions are taken based on a simple majority.	
Luxembourg		
meeting	Meeting quorum: 2/3 of members must be present.	
During	Decisions are taken if a minimum of half of the total number of HPC3	
Luxembourg	members are in agreement.	
meeting		
U		

The 2 original propositions were deleted and replaced it by a majority of total members of HPC3, as the original propositions allowed to take a decision if less than half of members of HPC3 agree, which is not what is wanted.

Working groups rules

(Refers to the section "Scope of actions")

Before	The GA members needs to vote on the creation of a working group and its	
Luxembourg	composition.	
meeting		
	Working groups can be composed of either GA members and GA observers.	
	The working group Chair person must come from a CoE.	
During	Working groups can be composed of both HPC3 members and HPC3	
Luxembourg	observers. The working group Chair person must come from a CoE. The	
meeting	creation of a working group is decided upon during an HPC3 meeting	

HPC3 deleted the act that the creation of a working group is submitted to vote.

Wording

The term "GA" from our original HPC3 ToR was replaced by "HCP3".